

# UPR MONITOR

International Service for Human Rights



Human Rights Monitor Series

## UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW, 2<sup>ND</sup> SESSION PAKISTAN (FINAL) REVIEWED ON 8 MAY 2008, AFTERNOON

Overview .....	1
General information on Pakistan.....	2
Information submitted to the Working Group .....	3
State report.....	3
Official UN documents.....	3
Other relevant stakeholders .....	4
Interactive dialogue.....	5
Presentation by the State .....	5
Table on the interactive dialogue .....	7
Concluding remarks .....	51
Adoption of the report [13 May 2008/5:30pm and 14 May 2008/12:15pm].....	51

### Overview

Pakistan's delegation was headed by HE Ms Fauzia Wahab, Member of the National Assembly, and comprised ten members. Seventy states took the floor during the session, raising a broad range of issues. Many states commended Pakistan on its efforts to improve its human rights record during a challenging transitional phase towards full democracy. Many other states were more critical, and raised a range of perceived inadequacies in Pakistan's approach. Key issues raised during the interactive dialogue included the following:

- Judicial reform and independence, including the reinstatement of dismissed judges;
- The death penalty;
- Prison conditions;
- Counter-terrorism strategies, and their human rights implications;
- Gender equality;
- Rights of women, including honour killings, violence against women, and forced marriage;
- Adultery, and the *Haddood Ordinances*;
- Treatment of minorities, including on the basis of religion and caste;
- Blasphemy;

- Interfaith dialogue;
- Child abuse;
- Trafficking in persons;
- Violations and impunity by the security forces, including arbitrary arrests, enforced disappearances, extrajudicial killings, and torture;
- The establishment of a national human rights institution (NHRI);
- Ratification of core human rights instruments, including the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* (ICCPR) and the *Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment* (CAT);
- Pakistan's role in the Human Rights Council;
- Cooperation with UN Special Procedures;
- Freedom of the media;
- Human rights defenders;
- The role of civil society;
- Refugees;
- Economic development and poverty reduction;
- Education, including the reform of *madrassas*.

Due to the large volume of states taking the floor, Pakistan responded to large clusters of questions, and the session continued well over its scheduled time despite the Chair's request that statements be limited to two rather than three minutes. Pakistan responded to some of the issues raised, but not others, and acknowledged that it continued to face various challenges in its efforts to advance the cause of human rights.

Pakistan assured the audience that it would seriously consider the comments and recommendations made by states. Having said that, the adoption of the Working Group's report on Pakistan proved to be controversial. Pakistan (backed by Egypt) sought to include a paragraph in the report 'noting' that some of the recommendations therein (concerning non-marital consensual sex, defamation, the death penalty, and ordinances dealing with honour killings) did not fall under the framework of universally recognised human rights nor conform to its laws, pledges and commitments, and therefore could not be accepted. A robust debate ensued, and continued into the next day. Various states<sup>1</sup> rejected Pakistan's efforts to imply a factual international legal judgment on recommendations put forward by other states, and to introduce new criteria for the acceptance of recommendations – which, they argued, would set a precedent that was not in line with the spirit of the institution-building package. On the following day, compromise language was found whereby Pakistan, in the relevant paragraph, 'considered' rather than 'noted' that the recommendations in question were not universally recognised human rights nor conformed to Pakistan's laws, pledges and commitments, and that it therefore could not accept them. The report was then adopted by consensus.

## General information on Pakistan

### **Membership of the Human Rights Council**

Pakistan was an inaugural member of the Human Rights Council (1<sup>st</sup> term, 2006 – 2008), and was re-elected for a second term (2008-2011).

### **Members of the troika**

Saudi Arabia, Ghana, Azerbaijan<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Slovenia, Switzerland, Mexico, Canada, Netherlands, Italy.

<sup>2</sup> Pakistan did not request a member of its regional group. Regional groups selected: African Group, Asian Group, EEG. There were no objections by Pakistan or by the members of the troika to the selection. For a full summary of the selection of troikas, see [http://www.ishr.ch/hrm/council/councilalert/council\\_update\\_7session.pdf](http://www.ishr.ch/hrm/council/councilalert/council_update_7session.pdf)

## National consultation

The State report was compiled after extensive inter-Ministerial consultations at federal and provincial levels. In drafting the State report, the Minister for Human Rights held consultations with several national NGOs.<sup>3</sup> The place and date of these consultations were not specified in the State report.

## Information submitted to the Working Group

### State report<sup>4</sup>

Pakistan's State report gives an overview of its constitutional framework, and its political transition towards full democracy. It outlines Pakistan's normative and institutional framework for the promotion and protection of human rights, as well as the international human rights instruments to which Pakistan is a signatory. The report also sets out Pakistan's human rights achievements and challenges: elimination of discrimination; women's social, economic and political empowerment; political participation; children's rights and education; the rights of persons with disabilities; economic rights, poverty reduction, health; the protection of minorities and the status of refugees; and efforts to ensure freedom of information. Terrorism and extremism, lack of resources, and the lack of awareness of women's rights due to deep-rooted tribal and traditional mindsets figure among the main challenges that impede Pakistan's efforts.

### Official UN documents<sup>5</sup>

Pakistan<sup>6</sup> was encouraged to ratify several human rights instruments.<sup>7</sup> The state of emergency declared by Pakistan in November 2007 and the consequent suspension of fundamental rights raised concerns.<sup>8</sup> It was recommended that Pakistan ensure the application of the Convention of the Rights of the Child throughout its territory, establish an independent human rights monitoring mechanism according to the Paris Principles<sup>9</sup> and provide its National Commissions with adequate authority and resources.<sup>10</sup> Pakistan's adoption of the *National Plan of Action* (1998) and the *Gender Reform Action Plan* (2005) were welcomed, but the lack of an effective mechanism to monitor their implementation was identified as a concern.<sup>11</sup> Other specific issues of

---

<sup>3</sup> Including Save the Children, SEHER, CARITAS, Global Welfare Trust, Research Society of International Law (RSIL) and Ansar Burney Trust.

<sup>4</sup> A/HRC/WG.6/2/PAK/1, available at <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/PAGES/PKSession2.aspx>

<sup>5</sup> A/HRC/WG.6/2/PAK/2, available at <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/PAGES/PKSession2.aspx>

<sup>6</sup> Core universal human rights treaties to which Pakistan is a party: *International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination* (CERD), *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women* (CEDAW), *Convention on the Rights of the Child* (CRC).

<sup>7</sup> International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT), Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (OP-CAT), Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (CRMW), Palermo Protocol, International Labour Organisation (ILO) Work Convention No. 177, Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (OP-CEDAW), Convention on the Protection of Persons from Enforced Disappearance (CED), Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict (CRC-OPAC), Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography (CRC-OPSC), The 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol, ILO Minimum Age Convention (No. 138)

<sup>8</sup> High Commissioner for Human Rights

<sup>9</sup> Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC)

<sup>10</sup> CRC, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW)

<sup>11</sup> CEDAW

concern included: discrimination against women and gender equality;<sup>12</sup> discrimination on the basis of religion; the death penalty; honour killings; excessive use of force by security forces; targeted killings and counter-terrorism measures;<sup>13</sup> violence against and trafficking of women and girls;<sup>14</sup> violence against children;<sup>15</sup> torture;<sup>16</sup> the situation of human rights defenders; poverty and inadequate health services; access to education and illiteracy, particularly among women; the rights of minorities;<sup>17</sup> and conditions in refugee camps.<sup>18</sup> It was noted that Pakistan hosts one of the largest refugee populations in the world while facing serious economic challenges and armed conflict.<sup>19</sup>

### Other relevant stakeholders<sup>20</sup>

The summary report compiles information submitted by 21 civil society organisations.<sup>21</sup> Pakistan's unfulfilled pledge to ratify the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* (ICCPR), the *International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights* (ICESCR) and the *Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment* (CAT) was noted.<sup>22</sup> Regarding the constitutional and legislative framework, it was noted that the state of emergency imposed in November and December 2007 had empowered the President to amend the Constitution and suspend fundamental human rights.<sup>23</sup> It was observed that a Paris Principles-compliant national human rights institution did not exist.<sup>24</sup> Other specific issues of concern included: Pakistan's lack of cooperation with human rights mechanisms, particularly the UN special procedures;<sup>25</sup> discrimination and violence against women<sup>26</sup>; discrimination on the basis of caste, descent and occupation;<sup>27</sup> use of the death penalty;<sup>28</sup> systematic human rights violations by

---

<sup>12</sup> CEDAW, Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD)

<sup>13</sup> Special Rapporteur on extra-judicial, summary or arbitrary executions

<sup>14</sup> Special Rapporteurs on torture and on violence against women, United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), CEDAW

<sup>15</sup> CRC

<sup>16</sup> Special Rapporteur on torture

<sup>17</sup> United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF), CEDAW, CRC, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

<sup>18</sup> United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)

<sup>19</sup> UNHCR, CRC

<sup>20</sup> A/HRC/WG.6/2/PAK/3, available at <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/PAGES/PKSession2.aspx>

<sup>21</sup> Asian Centre for Human Rights (ACHR), Amnesty International (AI), Anti-Slavery International (ASI), Asian Legal Resource Centre (ALRC), The Becket Fund for Religious Liberty (BFRL), Christian Solidarity Worldwide (CSW), Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative (CHRI), International Federation for Human Rights (FIDH), Global Initiative to End All Corporal Punishment of Children (GIECP), Human Rights First (HRF), Human Rights Watch (HRW), International Gay and Lesbian Human Rights Commission (IGLHRC), Joint submission: International Lesbian and Gay Association (ILGA), International Gay and Lesbian Human Rights Commission (ILGA-Europe), ARC International, Institute on Religion and Public Policy (IRPP), International Commission of Jurists (ICJ), International Displacement Monitoring Centre of the Norwegian Refugee Council (IDMC), Jammu and Kashmir Council for Human Rights (JKCHR), Joint submission (1) of National Commission for Justice and Peace, Democratic Commission for Human Development, Supreme Court Bar Association of Pakistan, Aurat Foundation, Pakistan Federal Union Of Journalists, Lok Sangat, Pakistan Forum for Social Democracy, Strengthening Participatory Organization (JS1), Joint submission (2) of Thardeep Rural Development Programme, Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research, International Dalit Solidarity Network (JS2), Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO).

<sup>22</sup> ACHR

<sup>23</sup> AI

<sup>24</sup> JS1

<sup>25</sup> FIDH

<sup>26</sup> HRW, UNPO, FIDH

<sup>27</sup> JS2

<sup>28</sup> FIDH, AI

officials;<sup>29</sup> widespread torture, other ill-treatment and arbitrary arrest and detention;<sup>30</sup> the tenuous position of the judiciary;<sup>31</sup> impunity;<sup>32</sup> violations of the freedom of religion or belief, expression, association and peaceful assembly.<sup>33</sup> Counter-terrorism policies were identified as a factor accounting for various human rights violations. It was observed that Anti-Terrorism Courts failed to provide fair trials.<sup>34</sup> Regarding Pakistan's achievements, the enactment of the *Women's Protection Act* was noted<sup>35</sup> and the adoption of a human rights perspective by the higher judiciary was welcomed.<sup>36</sup> No information was included under the sections on key national priorities, initiatives and commitments, and capacity building and technical assistance.

### Interactive dialogue<sup>37</sup>

The Chair noted that a very long list of speakers wished to take the floor, and advised that the speaking limit would be restricted to two minutes each.

### Presentation by the State

The head of Pakistan's delegation, HE Ms Fauzia Wahab, Member of the National Assembly, noted that the UPR was a nascent mechanism that needed to be nurtured with care and skill. It would serve as a catalyst for dialogue on human rights in the Pakistan Government, and would increase human rights awareness in Pakistan. Ms Wahab outlined Pakistan's historic development, which she said had led to a vision based on a model of a modern, moderate, and democratic political system upholding human rights. The constitution was reflective of these principles, and guaranteed fundamental rights; economic, social and cultural rights; freedom of thought, expression, and belief; and an independent judiciary. It prohibited discrimination and trafficking, and provided for the representation of women in public life. The challenge was to translate these provisions into an ethos, to be implemented in all spheres. Pakistan, according to the head of delegation, had made impressive strides, but still had a long way to go.

Pakistan attached value to its association with the human rights machinery, particularly the Human Rights Council. It was party to several instruments, including the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination* (CERD), the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women* (CEDAW), the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* (CRC), and instruments on trafficking and child labour. Consistent with its 2006 pledges, the Government had in April 2008 ratified the *International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights* (ICESCR), and had signed the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* (ICCPR) and the *Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment* (CAT). Pakistan advised that it had a separate government ministry dealing with human rights, and had laid the groundwork for an independent human rights commission, in line with the Paris Principles. It also attached high importance to human rights education.

---

<sup>29</sup> ACHR, IDMC, FIDH, JS1

<sup>30</sup> ALRC, AI, ACHR

<sup>31</sup> JS1

<sup>32</sup> ACHR

<sup>33</sup> BFRL, IRPP, CSW, AI, ACHR, HRW, ALRC, FIDH

<sup>34</sup> AI, HRW, ICJ

<sup>35</sup> IRRP

<sup>36</sup> AI

<sup>37</sup> Most statements made at the UPR Working Group can be found at <http://portal.ohchr.org/portal/page/portal/UPR>. Fill in the form at [www.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/form.htm](http://www.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/form.htm) to receive username and password. Audiovisual archives of the meetings of the Working Group 'webcast' are available at [www.un.org/webcast/unhrc/index.asp](http://www.un.org/webcast/unhrc/index.asp).

The delegation announced that Pakistan had recently completed its full transition to a full democracy. Democracy would need to be supported by the rule of law and accountability, and to incorporate appropriate checks and balances. The Government intended to release judges from detention, and was looking into the modalities. Pakistan's vibrant civil society played a key role in ensuring a culture of accountability.

Over the past five years, continued the delegation, Pakistan had paid a heavy price for the war on terrorism. Many of its soldiers and citizens had died or been injured. Pakistan would persist in its efforts on this front. It acknowledged that strong military action alone could not win the war. Also necessary were the promotion of democratic values; expansion of economic opportunities; strengthening of the rule of law; and reform of the *madrassas*.

Poverty reduction was an absolute priority. Pakistan had made progress on decreasing its poverty rate, but 25% of people still lived below the poverty line. Nevertheless, the macroeconomic indicators were promising. Pakistan aimed to construct a million housing units annually, to implement illiteracy and health programs, address price hikes and food shortages, and create jobs. On gender issues, its goals included mainstreaming the political and economic empowerment of women; ending honour killings; eliminating abuses of the law violating women's rights, for example with regard to inheritance and forced marriage; addressing domestic violence; and improving women's participation in decision-making at the highest level.

The Pakistan delegation considered minorities to be an integral part of Pakistani society. They were said to be guaranteed equal civil and political rights under the new constitution. The Prime Minister had declared that minorities were to have representation in all institutions. Any statutes which allowed for discrimination against religious minorities were to be reviewed.

The delegation asserted that Pakistan had one of the freest and most vibrant media sectors in South Asia and the world. There were a large number of television channels, newspapers and periodicals, and some of the restrictions placed on the media as part of the 2007 emergency orders had now been revoked.

Pakistan had hosted some 5 million Afghan refugees since 1979, and although it was not a signatory to the 1951 *Convention relating to the Status of Refugees*, had abided by its provisions. Recently, Pakistan had reached an agreement with UNHCR and Afghanistan for the gradual repatriation of refugees. It remained important for the international community to continue to provide support to Afghan refugees in Pakistan.

The delegation advised that the new democratic government would place rights holders at the centre of its endeavours, which were aimed at the economic and social development of the state.

Table on the interactive dialogue

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
<b>PALESTINE</b>	Pakistan was ‘reborn’: it was witnessing the dawn of democracy and reconciliation. Appreciates commitment to human rights. Notes modern view of women’s roles: 11 Ambassadors were women, as was the speaker.				Drafted in close cooperation with civil society.	
<b>CHINA</b>	Active action on economic development and poverty reduction. Congratulations on numerous achievements in economic development, health, literacy. Welcome recent ratifications/signatures of the <i>International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)</i> , the		How does Pakistan protect the rights of its minorities?		Comprehensive report. Extensive consultations with NGOs in preparing report.	<i>Minorities</i> : see Canada below.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	<p><i>Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT)</i> etc. Good progress on protecting the rights of women, children, disabled persons, etc.</p>					
<b>ALGERIA</b>	<p>Applauds considerable contribution of Ambassador in Human Rights Council's institution-building. Good progress on women's rights and development. Notes national plan of action, and gender reform plan. Welcomes women's political engagement, and their participation in key positions in public life.</p>			<p>Spearhead progress to ensure women's equality in education and employment. Continue fight against terrorism.</p>		<p><i>Rights of women:</i> are recognised by the constitution. Pakistan is a signatory to the ILO convention eliminating discrimination in labour. There is no discrimination in considering legal testimonies. Women hold important positions in government and non-government sectors. Efforts to further improve equality</p>



Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
						<p>are continuing. The Government is mindful of patriarchal attitudes, and is working vigorously to combat them. The school curriculum aims to give a realistic perception of the role of women in society. Religious scholars are assisting in cultural and social change.</p>
<b>INDONESIA</b>	<p>Pakistan has demonstrated that it seeks to ensure a comprehensive standard of human rights, as evidenced by recent ratification/signature of ICESCR, ICCPR, CAT. Pakistan has also sought to ensure the</p>					

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	<p>adequate protection of vulnerable groups, including women and children. Zero tolerance for violence against women. Safeguards in place for protecting minorities. Pakistan deals with economic and social rights, as well as civil and political rights, in a comprehensive way.</p>					
<b>TUNISIA</b>	<p>Welcomes ratification of ICESCR and signature of ICCPR and CAT. Welcomes success of democracy.</p>			<p>Continue along the present path to promote and protect human rights, with the encouragement of the international community.</p>		
<b>MALAYSIA</b>	<p>Notes commitment to the promotion and protection of human rights. Significant institutional efforts in this regard. Significant progress in poverty eradication, education, health,</p>		<p>What measures are being considered under the Plan of Action for Education for All, and what is the role of the <i>madrassas</i> under the plan?</p>			<p><i>Education:</i> Pakistan has a 40 year old education system. Primary and secondary schooling is free. The literacy rate has increased</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	<p>rights of children, women. Notes open democratic processes, and the transition to full democracy. Notes Pakistan on track to achieve universal primary education by 2015. Constructive and balanced leadership as head of the Organisation of the Islamic in the Human Rights Council.</p>					<p>from 13% at independence, to 56% today. There is a need to improve the skills of teachers – for this purpose, various program were being implemented, curricula updated etc. Pakistan welcomes the international community’s interest in assisting with teacher training. There are 13000-15000 <i>madrassas</i> in the country. This segment of the education system was neglected in the past. For the last couple of years Pakistan has been very focused on them, and the</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
						curriculum has been updated regarding religious stereotyping.
<b>DEMOCRATIC PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF KOREA</b>	<p>Many rights are incorporated in constitution.</p> <p>Commends progress on human rights despite challenges eg natural disasters, threat of terrorism.</p> <p>Commends women's empowerment.</p> <p>As coordinator of the Organisation of the Islamic Conference, Pakistan played an important role in construction of Human Rights Council.</p>		Requests more information on technical and vocational education under the education policy of 1998-2010.			<i>Education:</i> see Malaysia above.
<b>CANADA</b>		<p>Gender discrimination and violence against women remains a problem.</p> <p>Treatment of <i>Ahmadiya</i> minority is a concern.</p>		Ensure that victims of violations have access to legal redress, that perpetrators are prosecuted and punished, and that officials are trained		<p><i>Rights of women:</i> see Algeria above.</p> <p><i>Decriminalising non-marital consensual sex:</i> Pakistan wouldn't ask</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
		<p>Penal Code allows imprisonment of religious minorities for preaching. Efforts to counter terrorism may contravene human rights law.</p>		<p>in gender sensitivity. Repeal <i>Hadood Ordinances</i> provisions that criminalise consensual sex, and fail to recognise marital rape. Remove restrictions on religious belief, and amend legislation that discriminates against religious minorities. Implement human rights law in the fight against terrorism, and refrain from detention that contravenes international standards of due process. Reinstate the judiciary, and re-establish an independent judiciary. Decriminalise</p>		<p>Canada to <b>criminalise</b> consensual sex (the principle stems from our own legislation and values – ‘we can’t sell it in Pakistan’). Consensual and non-marital sex are not issues that are covered by recognised human rights. While every individual can live as he or she wishes, every society has its norms and values. The legal system governs adultery, which is dealt with through the <i>Hadood</i> laws. The offence can only be proven by four credible</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				<p>defamation. Review laws and measures, to ensure that restrictions on freedom of expression are in line with ICCPR obligations.</p>		<p>witnesses, or a confession. It is considered an act against society and decent living. <i>Religious discrimination:</i> constitution does not allow religious discrimination. The penal code also legislates against this. Laws are not minority specific. Pakistan is surprised there is a wrong perception of the treatment of minorities in Pakistan. Minorities are an integral part of the social fabric. Strange to hear Pakistan is accused of being discriminatory.</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
						<p>We could not think of discriminating. Members of minorities are well-educated, and involved in teaching, health. Minorities are very much integrated. Their emigration is not due to discrimination, just better remuneration elsewhere. There are some isolated incidents of abuses against minorities. But overall, they are very much part of society, and ‘nobody can dare to do anything wrong with them.’</p> <p><i>Independence of the judiciary: see</i></p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
<b>CHILE</b>	Acknowledges ratification/signature of ICCPR, ICESCR, CAT. Notes policies promoting empowerment of women, and zero tolerance of violence against women. Notes the 2004 act criminalising honour killings, and urges its implementation.		What is Pakistan doing to ensure freedom of worship and integrity of religious communities?	Speed up the ratification of ICCPR and CAT.		France below. <i>Minorities</i> : see Canada above.
<b>SLOVENIA</b>	Notes positive reforms on elimination of discrimination against women.	Concerned about effectiveness of implementing measures to eliminate discrimination against women, and to outlaw honour killings.	More information requested on concrete steps to align prohibition of discrimination against women with provisions of the CEDAW. Regarding the industrial relations ordinance, why does it restrict rights to union member and collective bargaining? What is Pakistan doing to harmonise national	Adopt more concrete steps to align prohibition of discrimination against women with provisions of the CEDAW. Adopt labour legislation in line with ILO conventions. Integrate a gender-perspective in the follow-up process to the UPR.	Comprehensive report.	<i>Discrimination against women</i> : see Algeria above.



Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
			legislation with international obligations?			
<b>SAUDI ARABIA</b>	<p>Welcomes constructive cooperation with human rights mechanisms, and efforts in the Human Rights Council.</p> <p>The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women commended Pakistan for adopting a national plan of action in 1998.</p> <p>Adoption of a code of conduct on children is also a positive step.</p> <p>While Pakistan is not party to the 1951 Convention on the Status of Refugees, it should be commended for the efforts it has made to accommodate large numbers of Afghan refugees.</p>		Regarding Pakistan's decision to close refugee camps and repatriate their residents, how does this fit with the principle of voluntary repatriation?			<p><i>Refugees:</i> they are not being expelled. There is a formal agreement with UNHCR and Afghanistan, which provides for coordinated and voluntary repatriations.</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	Pakistan's efforts in fighting terrorism should be recognised.					
<b>BELGIUM</b>	Notes legislative measures to eradicate sexual abuse of children. Notes the child protection bill under consideration.	Trafficking and sexual abuse of children still widespread. Blasphemy law leads to a disproportionate number of non-Muslims being accused of blasphemy and detained before allegations are properly investigated.	What measures are being considered to enforce existing laws, and to discourage trafficking and sexual abuse of children?	More effectively address the issue of child abuse and trafficking through enforcement of national legislation, in conformity with international obligations. Awareness-raising and training of parents, law enforcement officers and the judiciary on child abuse and trafficking. Bring law on blasphemy in line with principles of ICCPR, CERD, and other international standards on non-discrimination.		<i>Blasphemy laws:</i> these can be abused. Pakistan introduced checks in the system to prevent abuse of the blasphemy law. A new amendment provides for a preliminary investigation of such allegations by senior police officers, which should deter filing of spurious cases under the blasphemy law.
<b>HOLY SEE</b>	Notes freedom of thought, faith, expression, and association are	Blasphemy law in violation of ICCPR articles 18 and 19. Under the penal	Are there plans to adjust blasphemy laws, to put them in line with the ICCPR and	Ratify the ICCPR as soon as possible, and adjust national laws to Pakistan's	Well-prepared national report.	<i>Blasphemy:</i> see Belgium above. <i>Minority rights:</i> see Canada above

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	anchored in the constitution – the cornerstone of a democratic society. Notes signing of the ICCPR.	code against blasphemy, many are punished on the basis of a vague definition of the term. Little evidence appears to be required, and the provision is misused to target minorities.	Pakistan Constitution? Are there plans to promote awareness among the population, police, and military forces that minorities have the same rights as all Pakistanis?	international obligations.		and Denmark below.
<b>SOUTH AFRICA</b>	Welcomes transition to democracy. Notes rise in average Gross Domestic Product. Notes constructive role in the Human Rights Council.		What strategies are being used to overcome tribal and traditional mindsets which constrain women's empowerment? Regarding illiteracy, what will the Government do to ensure that girls can access education at all levels? Will Pakistan ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court?	Enhance efforts to provide adequate housing.		<i>Women's rights:</i> see Algeria above. <i>Education:</i> see Malaysia above. <i>Housing:</i> see Nigeria below.
<b>UK</b>	Successful recent elections.	Regarding the death penalty, there	Further information requested on	Establish a national human rights		<i>NHRI:</i> A national human rights

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	Notes moves to sign or ratify ICCPR, ICESCR, and CAT.	are concerns about miscarriage of justice.	<p>establishment of a national commission. What practical measures will ensure the implementation of the international instruments Pakistan ratifies? (including repealing discriminatory laws, and safeguarding the rights of minorities). What steps will Pakistan take to monitor and investigate violations by security forces, including arbitrary arrests, enforced disappearances, extrajudicial killings, and torture?</p> <p>What steps is Pakistan taking to implement the UN General Assembly resolution calling for a moratorium on the death penalty?</p>	<p>institution (NHRI) in accordance with the Paris Principles. Review the death penalty with a view to introducing a moratorium and abolishing it. Repeal the <i>Haddood and Zina Ordinances</i>. Ensure that the Women’s Protection Act is compatible with CEDAW. Ensure that civil society is involved in the UPR follow up.</p>		<p>commission was in the process of being formed. Pakistan wanted it to be genuine. <i>Minorities</i>: see Canada above. <i>Impunity</i>: see Sweden below. <i>Death penalty</i>: this does not contradict the universally recognised human rights. States can determine their own penal system. Pakistan has identified the death penalty for specific crimes, but it can only be imposed after the exhaustion of all legal remedies. There are several tiers of the justice system, and various</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
						<p>opportunities to lodge appeals. Consideration was being given to commuting the death penalty into life imprisonment, and a decision was expected shortly. <i>Hadood and Zina Ordinances: see Canada above.</i></p>
<b>PORTUGAL</b>	<p>Welcomes visit of Special Rapporteur on violence against women. Welcomes National Action Plan and Gender Reform Action Plan.</p>	<p>Religious minorities continue to face discrimination.</p>	<p>What monitoring mechanisms are in place to ensure implementation of the National Action Plan and Gender Reform Action Plan? What measures are in place to stop honour killings and prevent domestic violence? What concrete steps is Pakistan taking to protect minorities from discrimination?</p>	<p>Maintain commitment to overcome barriers in human rights promotion caused by traditional and tribal mindsets. Implement CEDAW recommendation to remove Pakistan's declaration that makes CEDAW obligations subject to the constitution. Give serious consideration to</p>	<p>Excellent report.</p>	<p><i>Domestic violence:</i> Pakistan had introduced legislation and amendments to existing laws. Strong advocacy and awareness-campaigns had been conducted in the media and by Government and civil society. <i>Honour killings:</i> Following an</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				<p>inviting those Special Procedures that have sought to visit.</p>		<p>amendment to it, the criminal law considers honour killing to be premeditated murder. The minimum penalty for it is 10 years imprisonment. New legal bills sought to amend the <i>Haddood</i> laws, to ensure that they are not misused. Government is aware of the need for further reform, and will benefit from expert advice from donors and legal experts. Plans to further empower the Ministry of Women's Development. CEDAW obligations were</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
						<p>implemented and monitored, with assistance from donors and legal experts. Governments have become conscious of this issue. Legislation has been developed. It was now a matter of how to implement it. It may take time to break away from the patriarchal system. <i>Minorities:</i> see Canada above. <i>Special Procedures:</i> see Mexico below.</p>
<b>KUWAIT</b>	Notes measures undertaken in the framework of the UPR.		In the fight against terrorism, how does Pakistan ensure that the measures it takes are in conformity with human rights principles?	Positive reaction warranted for Pakistan's efforts to confront this humanitarian problem, which can be used as a lesson		

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
			Noting that Pakistan has the largest number of refugees, what are the major challenges in this regard?	for others.		
<b>MEXICO</b>	Notes Pakistan's approach to the ICCPR and ICESCR. Important contribution in the Human Rights Council, including review of mandates.		More information requested on the status of the 1951 Refugee Convention and the 1967 Protocol.	Ratify ICCPR and CAT. Accept visits by Special Procedures, respond to their communications, urgent measures, and questionnaires. Strengthen measures to eradicate discrimination and violence against women, and measures to investigate crimes against women. Ratify the <i>Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court</i> , the <i>International Convention on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced</i>		<i>Special Procedures:</i> Pakistan has not been sufficiently engaging. There are outstanding invitations. Pakistan will welcome a visit by the High Commissioner for Human Rights. <i>International Convention on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance:</i> Pakistan is about to acceded to it. <i>Women's rights:</i> see Algeria above.



Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				<i>Disappearance</i> and the 1977 Protocols Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 1949. In fighting terrorism, adhere to human rights law, refugee law, and international humanitarian law.		<i>Domestic violence</i> : see Portugal above.
<b>JAPAN</b>	Good economic initiatives. Notes steps to ratify ICESCR, and sign ICCPR and CAT.		What measures is Pakistan planning to secure freedom of expression and association? What action is being taken to further realise the empowerment of women?		Comprehensive report.	<i>Women's rights</i> : see Algeria above.
<b>OMAN</b>	Notes Pakistan's position on ICESCR, ICCPR, and CAT.		To what degree do civil society organisations take part in drafting national plans on human rights?	Pursue the enhancement of human rights by taking the necessary measures to achieve this goal.	Comprehensive, excellent report.	<i>Civil society</i> : in Pakistan it is very vibrant and effective, and has the freedom to carry out its work.
<b>QATAR</b>	Prominent role as head of the OIC in the Human Rights Council.		What policies aim to overcome the tribal and traditional			<i>Haddood and Zina Ordinances</i> : see Canada above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	<p>Human rights guaranteed in the constitution. Pakistan has ratified many international human rights conventions. Important measures to protect minorities, women and children. Notes policies to provide a decent standard of living to the disabled.</p>		<p>mentalities that obstruct the rights of women?</p>			<p><i>Domestic violence</i>: see Portugal above. <i>Women's rights</i>: see Algeria above.</p>
<p><b>FRANCE</b></p>	<p>Notes Pakistan's stance on the ICCPR, ICESCR, and CAT. Welcomes the launching of a procedure to create a national human rights institution.</p>		<p>What steps are being taken to ensure that the status of a new national human rights institution (NHRI) is in accordance with the Paris Principles? Will Pakistan sign and ratify the <i>International Convention on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance</i>? Will there be further amendments to the blasphemy act?</p>	<p>Sign and ratify the <i>International Convention on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance</i>.</p>		<p><i>NHRI</i>: see United Kingdom above. <i>International Convention on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance</i>: see Mexico above. <i>Blasphemy</i>: see Belgium above. <i>Judicial independence</i>: Pakistan is</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
			<p>What steps are being taken to ensure independence of the judiciary and access for all to justice?                      What steps will Pakistan take pursuant to the UN General Assembly resolution on a death penalty moratorium?</p>			<p>committed to an independent judiciary. The judiciary in Pakistan is very vibrant, as is civil society. That was evidence recently in the form of the lawyers' movement. The issue of restoration of those lawyers and judges released from detention is currently being examined.  <i>Death penalty:</i> see United Kingdom above.</p>
<b>SENEGAL</b>	<p>Notes efforts to improve the status of women, children, and the disabled.                      Notes progress in education and health.</p>		<p>Will Pakistan ratify the <i>International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families</i>?</p>	<p>Spare no effort to meet the challenges of security, as seen in the responses to disasters of 2005 and 2007.</p>		
<b>PHILIPPINES</b>	<p>Encouraged by progress on civil and</p>		<p>More information requested on the work</p>	<p>Ratify other core treaties that Pakistan</p>		<p><i>Domestic violence:</i> see</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	<p>political rights, as well as economic and social rights, despite the challenges of extremism and natural disasters.</p> <p>Welcome moves to establish a national human rights institution as per Paris Principles.</p> <p>Notes child protection bill being drafted, and hopes it will soon be enacted.</p> <p>Notes efforts to promote interfaith dialogue.</p>		<p>of the District Interfaith Committees.</p>	<p>has not yet ratified.</p> <p>Give due attention to combating violence against women, and promoting the rights of children.</p>		<p>Portugal above.</p>
<b>LUXEMBOURG</b>	<p>Notes increase in the health budget.</p>	<p>Women continue to suffer poverty, and have a low level of literacy.</p> <p>Health services remain inadequate for many.</p> <p>Few governments spend so little on health as Pakistan.</p>	<p>What measures aim to end inequality between men and women, particularly regarding property?</p> <p>What initiatives aim to address caste discrimination?</p>	<p>End gender inequality, particularly with regards to property.</p> <p>Increase health spending, to increase access to health care.</p> <p>Take measures to assist women in rural areas gain access to health, education, and</p>		<p><i>Gender equality:</i> see Algeria above.</p> <p><i>Caste discrimination:</i> see Denmark below.</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				sanitation. Take measures to eliminate caste discrimination and poverty.		
<b>TURKEY</b>	Notes plans to reform the justice and education systems. Notes reforms to eliminate discrimination against women. Notes criminal law amendment to prosecute honour killings, and reform the <i>Hadood</i> ordinances. Notes the Child Protection Bill and the Child Protection Policy, including provisions for abolishing harmful traditional practices.		Request for further information about these initiatives (as specified in ‘positive comments’).			<i>Judicial reform:</i> see France above. <i>Women’s rights:</i> see Algeria above. <i>Honour killings:</i> see Portugal above. <i>Hadood ordinances:</i> see Canada above.
<b>RUSSIA</b>	Notes active role of Pakistan in the Human Rights Council. Notes fulfilment of voluntary commitments,		Regarding the draft act on protecting children, which provides for a prohibition on corporal punishment, how will these provisions fit		Broad consultations with civil society in preparing report. Self-critical tone of the report.	<i>Minorities:</i> see Canada above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	<p>including ratification of ICESCR, and signature of ICCPR and CAT. Notes the law protecting children, which is under consideration.</p>		<p>with the criminal code which permits corporal punishment in schools? What steps have been taken to provide ethnic and linguistic groups the same status as that enjoyed by religious minorities (as recommended by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination)?</p>			
<b>SWITZERLAND</b>	<p>Notes ratification of ICESCR, signature of ICCPR and CAT. Notes Pakistan's priority to promote women's rights. Welcomes legal provisions to strengthen these rights.</p>			<p>Ratify ICCPR and CAT. Prevent early and forced marriage. Recognise marital rape in legislation. Implement law on protection of children. Implement 2000 edict on justice for minors. With a view to universal elimination of death penalty, declare a</p>		<p><i>Hadood and Zina Ordinances:</i> see Canada above. <i>Domestic violence:</i> see Portugal above. <i>Women's rights:</i> see Algeria above. <i>Death penalty:</i> see United Kingdom above.</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				moratorium on executions. Respect the right to a fair trial.		
<b>CUBA</b>	Notes efforts to advance the legal status of women. Notes good results in education and health.		How did Pakistan achieve its success in reducing child labour?			<i>Child labour:</i> Pakistan is aware of the problem, and is trying to eliminate it. The reason is poverty, which drives children to work. It is mostly prevalent in the informal sector. Its presence is negligible in the formal sector.
<b>BELARUS</b>	Notes efforts as a coordinator in the Human Rights Council. Notes efforts on rights of women, children, and the disabled. Notes efforts in ensuring economic rights.			Continue efforts to de-politicise human rights in the UN system, and create conditions for consideration of human rights on the basis of equality, mutual respect and dialogue.	Self-critical report, which acknowledges the need for further measures.	
<b>NORWAY</b>	Notes steps to ratify ICESCR, and sign	Concerns about high number of	What measures are taken to address the	Ratification of ICCPR and CAT,		<i>Media freedom:</i> Pakistan has a

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	ICCPR and CAT.	outstanding Special Procedures visits. Journalists work under constant threat of attack, and are subjected to torture, illegal detention, death threats from state actors, insurgents, and political parties.	difficulties journalists encounter in their work?	and enacting legislation to ensure these are part of the domestic law. Issue standing invitations to Special Procedures. Investigate and prosecute perpetrators of acts against members of the media.		very independent and vibrant media, which can raise whatever issues it wishes. <i>Special procedures</i> : see Mexico above.
<b>JORDAN</b>	Notes progress on gender equality, and freedom of expression/association. Notes efforts to combat poverty.			Continue along the current path.		
<b>AUSTRIA</b>	Important role played in Human Rights Council. Notes position on ratifying/signing ICESCR, ICCPR, CAT. Notes legislative and policy measures to promote gender equality.	Prevalence of deep-rooted traditional mindsets. Discrimination provisions are not fully implemented.	What is the current status of the “prevention of anti-women practices” bill? More information on Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) in Pakistan. More information requested on the application of the death penalty, particularly in	Take measures to combat stereotypes, and safeguard the rights of women. Adopt measures to safeguard the human rights of IDPs.		<i>Haddood and Zina Ordinances</i> : see Canada above. <i>Domestic violence</i> : see Portugal above. <i>Women’s rights</i> : see Algeria above. <i>Death penalty</i> : see United Kingdom above.



Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
			relation to adultery and blasphemy.			<i>Blasphemy</i> : see Belgium above.
<b>UNITED ARAB EMIRATES</b>	Notes efforts to improve standard of living. Notes improving educational and poverty indicators.		What is the role of the Commission on Women's Rights in advancing women's rights?	Pakistan's achievements to be emulated by others.		<i>Commission for status of women</i> : has been formed. It serves to bring up issues condemned by the Government, and has facilitated improved communications between the Government and NGOs. Its mandate includes examining policies and programs for the development of women and gender equality, and examining legislation and suggesting amendments to discriminatory legislation.
<b>AZERBAIJAN</b>	Notes progress on		Share lessons learnt in		Good report.	

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	poverty reduction and women's rights. Notes work of District Interfaith Harmony Committees.		addressing refugee issues. More information requested on District Interfaith Harmony Committees.			
<b>BAHRAIN</b>	Notes tireless efforts to consolidate rights. Notes national program for maternal and infant health. Notes 'education for all' plan.		What efforts is Pakistan making to enhance freedom of information and of the media?			<i>Media freedom:</i> see Norway above.
<b>NETHERLANDS</b>	Notes democratic elections, and stated commitment to the rule of law. Notes ratification/signature of ICESCR, ICCPR, and CAT.			Incorporate ICCPR, ICESCR and other treaties (eg CEDAW CRC) into domestic legislation, and ensure effective implementation. Restore fundamental freedoms, as per constitution, that were suspended under the state of emergency, including by cancelling charges to human rights defenders, and re-		<i>Ratifications:</i> Pakistan intends to ratify the covenant (presumably means the ICCPR). This will take some time, while all the issues are considered. <i>Judicial independence:</i> see France above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				establishing an independent judiciary.		
<b>CZECH REPUBLIC</b>		Illegal <i>jirgas</i> still issue calls for violence against women.	What measures are used to eliminate calls by the <i>jirgas</i> for violence against women, and to punish those responsible?	<p>Give priority to adopting legislative and practical measures to combat violence against women.</p> <p>Decriminalise adultery and non-marital consensual sex.</p> <p>Ensure equal access to justice, and assign equal weight to evidence given by men and women.</p> <p>Raise awareness of laws regarding women, including by training authorities on how to deal with victims of sexual abuse and violence.</p> <p>Improve support services for women.</p> <p>Punish violence against women, prohibit provisions</p>		<p><i>Hadood and Zina Ordinances</i>: see Canada above.</p> <p><i>Domestic violence/honour killings</i>: see Portugal above.</p> <p><i>Women's rights</i>: see Algeria above.</p> <p><i>Special procedures</i>: see Mexico above.</p>

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				of the <i>Qisas</i> and <i>Diyat</i> law in cases of honour killings. Punish <i>jirgas</i> who call for violence against women. Issue a standing invitation to Special Procedures. Ratify the ICCPR, CAT, and the Optional Protocol to the CAT.		
<b>BANGLADESH</b>	Considerable progress on good governance. Good success on improving the status of women. Remarkable progress on aiming for education for all.		What measures are being adopted to modernise the educational system of <i>madrassas</i> ?	Encourages ‘pro-women’ policies, and affirmative action in this regard.		<i>Madrassas</i> : see Malaysia above. <i>Women’s rights</i> : see Algeria above.
<b>BRAZIL</b>	Notes positive measures to face human rights challenges, including with regard to the rights of children, women, and disabled persons.		What are Pakistan’s main priorities in implementing ICESCR? What steps are taken to combat racism and all forms of discrimination, including against	Consider acceding to the Convention on Enforced Disappearances. Continue efforts to ratify/implement ICCPR, ICESCR and CAT. Consider a policy on		<i>Women’s rights</i> : see Algeria above. <i>Human rights defenders</i> : there is a misconception that they are being obstructed.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
			<p>women?                      What steps are being taken to implement the CAT?                      What is the policy with regard to human rights defenders?                      What are the steps taken, and challenges faced, in guaranteeing children's rights?</p>	<p>protecting human rights defenders.</p>		<p>There are 5000 NGOs in the country, and they are very effective. The Government 'cannot dare' to put restrictions on them. They are allowed to view archives. The Government never objected to NGOs submitting independent reports.  <i>International Convention on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance:</i> see Mexico above.</p>
<b>PANAMA</b>	<p>Welcomes stance on ICESCR, ICCPR, and International Labour Organisation Convention 100.</p>		<p>More information requested on forecasts relating to the program for more drinking water.</p>			

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	Welcomes the inclusion of human rights studies in school curricula, including gender equality.					
<b>NEPAL</b>	Notes existence of institutional mechanisms for human rights. Notes assistance to refugees. Notes active role in Human Rights Council. Progress on education, health, rights of women and children.		Could Pakistan share how its plans for economic growth will ensure the even spread of economic and social rights?			
<b>DENMARK</b>		Low caste Hindus face caste-based discrimination. There are no specific laws or special measures to prohibit such discrimination.	What is Pakistan doing to ensure it has the proper legal framework to prevent discrimination based on caste, descent and occupation?	Take specific measures to prevent discrimination against <i>Dalits</i> . Repeal laws that discriminate against non-Muslims. Ratify ICCPR and CAT as a matter of priority.		<i>Caste discrimination:</i> Pakistan does not have this concept ( <i>Dalits</i> ) – it does not exist. “Who are Dalits?” There is no discrimination on the basis of caste or creed.
<b>SWEDEN</b>	Notes the ‘anti-women practices act,’ which aims to limit the	Credible accounts of forced marriage, honour killings, and	What further measures will Pakistan take to address gender	Take measures against gender discrimination and		<i>Gender equality:</i> see Algeria above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	consequences of the <i>Haddood</i> Ordinances.	little redress for the victims. Well documented abuses by security forces seem to go unpunished.	discrimination? What measures will Pakistan take to combat impunity among the security forces?	impunity in the security forces.		<i>Impunity:</i> There is no impunity for security forces and officials – they are trained in international humanitarian law. If they are suspected of committing any excesses, they are taken to court.
<b>GERMANY</b>	Notes recent elections.	As per concerns raised by CEDAW and CERD, discrimination against women persists in many laws. Concerns about the prison situation, especially lack of facilities (for women, children, and juveniles), lack of medical services, and overcrowding. Concerns about <i>Jum'a</i> sermons in mosques, which	What measures are being taken to address these issues (those in the 'critical comments' column)? What measures are taken to protect the rights of prisoners? What measures are taken to ensure that Pakistani law regarding banning incitement is respected?	Undertake a comprehensive review of all discriminatory legislation to achieve compliance with CEDAW.		<i>Gender equality:</i> see Algeria above. <i>Incitement:</i> this is a big problem. Inciting messages are broadcast through mosques. Governments have tried to stop or control it. But in such countries religious sentiments are high, and irrational. Pakistan is committed to

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
		incite hatred and violence.				eliminate this phenomenon. It requires more interaction and dialogue. <i>Female prisoners:</i> agree this is a problem. Prisons need reform. We are looking at it, and will address it as soon as possible.
<b>MOROCCO</b>	Welcomes progress on health, employment, and women's protection. Welcomes efforts made to protect vulnerable groups including children. Regarding minorities, notes political commitment to tolerance. Notes work of district committees for interfaith harmony.		What steps is Pakistan taking to establish a national human rights institution (NHRI)?	Recommends progress on ICESCR, ICCPR, and the 1951 Refugee Convention. Supports request for international assistance for social sector programs.		<i>NHRI:</i> see United Kingdom above.
<b>IRELAND</b>	Notes lifting of state of emergency, and release	Notes that the Special	When will Pakistan allow a visit of the	Invite the Special Representative of the		<i>Special Procedures:</i> see



Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	of human rights defenders. Notes commitment to establish an independent national human rights institution. (which should be in line with the Paris Principles).	Representative of the Secretary-General on the situation of human rights defenders requested to visit in 2003, and followed up in 2007.	Special Representative of the Secretary-General on the situation of human rights defenders?	Secretary-General on the situation of human rights defenders to visit. Effectively address the repressive affect of civil society monitoring procedures and anti-terrorism measures on the work of human rights defenders. Combat impunity for attacks on human rights defenders – and investigate and prosecute violations.		Mexico above. <i>Human rights defenders</i> : see Brazil above. <i>Impunity</i> : see Sweden above.
<b>BHUTAN</b>	Constructive work in creation of Human Rights Council. Notes progress on achieving Millennium Development Goals in the health sector.		How does Pakistan's geography pose a challenge to the critical infrastructure needs of its people? How can the international community assist to overcome these challenges?			
<b>SRI LANKA</b>	Significant role of Pakistan in the Human		(Sri Lanka made the point that it had no		Excellent report.	

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	Rights Council.		questions or recommendations for Pakistan, because it had a clear understanding of Pakistan's situation – it was faced with extremism and terrorism, both products of external factors).			
<b>ROMANIA</b>	Notes stance on ICESCR, ICCPR, and CAT.		What steps are taken to ensure efficient implementation of the ICESCR, ICCPR, and CAT? How does Pakistan envisage restoring the independence of the judiciary?	Ensure independence of the judiciary, including by applying strict rules and clear mechanisms for the appointment and dismissal of judges.		<i>Judicial independence:</i> see France above.
<b>NIGERIA</b>	Notes efforts to empower women. Notes that Pakistan hosts a large refugee population. Notes Pakistan's plan to build a million housing units every year.		Requests further information about the housing plan.			<i>Housing plan:</i> the highlight of the program is that female members of households are given ownership of the housing. It will be provided to those in the low income

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
						group. The Government will provide interest free loans, which aims to empower women, and trigger economic development.
<b>VENEZUELA</b>	Notes efforts to fulfil the promises made ahead of the 2006 Human Rights Council elections. Notes ratification/signature of ICESCR, ICCPR, and CAT.		What are the next steps towards establishing a national human rights institution (NHRI)? More information requested regarding progress achieved, and challenges faced, by the national commission on the rights of women.			<i>NHRI</i> : see United Kingdom above. <i>Commission on the rights of women</i> : see United Arab Emirates above.
<b>SINGAPORE</b>	Notes efforts to advance the interests of women and children. Welcomes legislation to advance the rights of women, including the <i>Women's Protection Bill</i> .					
<b>LATVIA</b>			What measures is Pakistan taking to improve conditions in	Encourages cooperation with the Special Procedures.		<i>Prison conditions</i> : see Germany above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
			prisons (noting problems with overcrowding, nutrition, etc)? Is Pakistan ready to issue a standing invitation to the Special Procedures?			<i>Special Procedures</i> : see Mexico above.
<b>SUDAN</b>	Notes contribution to the international human rights system.			Requests that Pakistan elaborate on its experience in poverty reduction and combating food inflation.		
<b>SYRIA</b>	Notes that Pakistan has an ‘ideal constitution and legal system’. Notes ratification of ICESCR and CEDAW, and signature of ICCPR and CAT. Notes achievements in: the political empowerment of women, criminalisation of honour killings, housing, and education. Notes Pakistan hosts a large number of Afghan refugees.		More information requested about media reports indicating that Pakistan may deport/repatriate Afghani refugees.			<i>Refugees</i> : see Saudi Arabia above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
<b>FINLAND</b>		Notes concerns of CRC in 2003 that public expenditure on education was very low.	Is the Government still committed to increasing education funding? Request for further information on plans to establish a national human rights institution (NHRI).	Take urgent measures to ensure adequate resources for education.		<i>Education:</i> see Malaysia above. <i>NHRI:</i> see United Kingdom above.
<b>REPUBLIC OF KOREA</b>	Notes position on ICESCR, ICCPR and CAT. Notes efforts to promote women's rights and eliminate discrimination against women.	Notes CEDAW concern about effective implementation of measures to promote women's rights.	What measures is Pakistan taking to address CEDAW's concern about the effective implementation of measures to promote women's rights? Update requested on the construction of the Lyari expressway.	Consider signing the 1951 Refugee Convention.		<i>Women's rights:</i> see Algeria above. <i>Lyari expressway:</i> all persons who were evicted during construction of the Lyari expressway have been amply and appropriately compensated.
<b>GREECE</b>		Access to justice is limited because of illiteracy and lack of awareness of rights. Reports of restrictions on the	What measures are in place to facilitate access to justice, especially for the poor? To what extent do law enforcement officials receive adequate	Guarantee the right to freedom of religion to non-Muslims.		<i>Training of officials:</i> see Sweden above. <i>Minorities:</i> see Canada above. <i>Impunity:</i> see Sweden above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
		media, and confiscation of equipment. Non-Muslim are discriminated against, which is an impediment to the freedom of religion. In the war on terror, cases of arbitrary detention and enforced disappearances.	education on human rights practices? How will Pakistan guarantee the right to freedom of religion to non-Muslims? How many cases of alleged arbitrary detention and enforced disappearances have been investigated? To what extent has the Government identified those responsible?			
<b>NICARAGUA</b>	Notes efforts on poverty reduction. Notes importance of role of women.			Encourage continued promotion and protection of the rights of women.		<i>Women's rights:</i> see Algeria above.
<b>ZIMBABWE</b>	Notes progress in human rights, particularly with regard to economic policies. Notes role of Pakistan in the Human Rights Council.					
<b>YEMEN</b>	Notes role in the construction of the Human Rights Council. Commends efforts to strengthen women's		What measures are taken to educate security and police forces about human rights?		Comprehensive report.	<i>Training of officials:</i> see Sweden above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	role in society, and protecting rights of children.					
<b>IRAN</b>	Notes adoption of national plan of action for children, child labour and juvenile justice. Notes the poverty reduction strategy paper. Notes cooperation with UN mechanisms. Notes plan to establish a national human rights institution.		What steps are being taken to increase efforts in fighting terrorism, manifestations of torture, economic exploitation, sexual exploitation, trafficking in women and children?	Increase efforts in fighting terrorism, manifestations of torture, economic exploitation, sexual exploitation, trafficking in women and children.	Comprehensive report.	
<b>ITALY</b>	Notes position on ICESCR, ICCPR and CAT.	Criminal justice frequently relies on the death penalty.	Following UN General Assembly resolution 62/149, would Pakistan consider reducing the number of offences for which the death penalty is imposed, and establishing a moratorium with a view to abolishing the death penalty?	Address violations against children, particularly with regard to labour, prostitution and trafficking, and increase age of criminal responsibility. Swiftly ratify major international human rights treaties, and strengthen cooperation with UN		<i>Death penalty:</i> see United Kingdom above.

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
				mechanisms including Special Procedures.		
<b>EGYPT</b>	Impressed with Pakistan's progress on democratisation and human rights. Commends Pakistan for its position on ICESCR, ICCPR and CAT. Notes progress on reducing child labour.		What challenges remain in combating child labour?	Encourage the establishment of a national human rights institution (NHRI).  (Egypt made the point here that blasphemy and adultery are not issues that fall within the category of 'human rights protection', and hence are not subject to recommendation)	Comprehensive report.	<i>Child labour</i> : see Cuba above. <i>NHRI</i> : see United Kingdom above.
<b>AUSTRALIA</b>	Notes improvement of political freedoms and intention to lift restrictions on media freedom. Welcomes position on ICCPR, CAT and ICESCR. Welcomes contributions to the Office of the High		Will Pakistan ratify the two Optional Protocols to the CRC which it signed in 2001 but has not ratified?	Accept visits of Special Procedures.		<i>Special Procedures</i> : see Mexico above.



Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	Commissioner for Human Rights.					
<b>MAURITIUS</b>	Notes efforts to promote and protect the human rights of women and children.				Extensive report.	
<b>ALBANIA</b>	Notes ratification of ICESCR, signature of ICCPR and CAT. Notes role in creation of the Human Rights Council.			Encourage Pakistan to become party to the 7 core treaties. Strengthen law enforcement capacities to enable them to address crimes committed as a result of traditional mentalities.	Comprehensive report.	
<b>COLOMBIA</b>	Notes the implementation of a plan of action for gender reform.		Regarding the plan of action for gender reform, how is the plan developing, and where is progress being made?			
<b>NEW ZEALAND</b>	Notes significant progress towards restoring democracy. Welcomes measures to release judges, and work towards an independent judiciary. Notes media freedoms	Concern about continuing reports of violence against women and girls. Lack of specific domestic violence legislation – Pakistan has not	What steps are being taken to address the issue of the <i>Hadood</i> Ordinances?	Prioritise the prevention of violence against women.		<i>Hadood and Zina Ordinances</i> : see Canada above. <i>Domestic violence/honour killings</i> : see Portugal above. <i>Women's rights</i> :

Country	Positive comments	Critical comments	Questions	Recommendations (incl questions as recommendations)	References to State report/ UN compilation/ OHCHR summary	Replies by the State under review
	are approaching pre-emergency levels.	repealed the <i>Hadood</i> Ordinances.				see Algeria above.

**DON'T DELETE SECTION BREAK**

## Concluding remarks

The Ambassador noted that the UPR session had been ‘oversubscribed’. He acknowledged that Pakistan was not a ‘paragon of perfection’, but that it had ‘covered some ground’. Pakistan faced some challenges, and would try to meet them with domestic resources, and with help from the international community. The Ambassador noted that many of the speakers had recognised that Pakistan was in a state of transition. It had started moving recently towards full democracy. The rule of law had been restored, and the focus on human rights was being mainstreamed. Civil society was vibrant, and the media very vigilant and active. The delegation conceded that it could not respond to all of the points that had been raised – many would require detailed examination, to be carried forward by the relevant bodies, such as ministries and the parliament.

Adoption of the report [13 May 2008/5:30pm  
and 14 May 2008/12:15pm]

The Pakistan delegation affirmed that the Government was fully committed to the promotion and protection of human rights without discrimination. Challenges remained, but these would be overcome. The delegation said it was touching to see such overwhelming participation in its UPR. It expressed thanks for the various remarks and suggestions it had received, and advised that it would give serious consideration to every recommendation that had been made. Pakistan, continued the delegation, attached importance to dialogue with all human rights mechanisms.

The adoption of the report itself was controversial. Pakistan sought to include in the adopted report a paragraph reading as follows: “Pakistan further **notes** that other recommendations in paragraphs 23(b)<sup>38</sup> and (f),<sup>39</sup> 30(b)<sup>40</sup> and (d),<sup>41</sup> 43(c),<sup>42</sup> and 62(b)<sup>43</sup> and (e)<sup>44</sup> in section II above neither fall under the framework of universally recognised human rights nor conform to its current laws, pledges and commitments, hence, cannot be accepted.”

The debate over this language continued over the allocated finishing time. Pakistan argued that the recommendations it identified in the proposed paragraph did not fit within the parameters of universal human rights principles, and were not compatible with its own legal or constitutional system. It added that these recommendations could be reflected in the summary of the report. Some delegations argued that Pakistan’s proposed wording was unacceptable as it had no basis in the institution building package, was not in spirit of the exercise,<sup>45</sup> and did not correspond to any reporting model that had been accepted.<sup>46</sup> These delegations suggested that Pakistan could choose to accept or reject recommendations, but that the recommendations made during the UPR should be reflected in the report without the country under review making a value judgment on their applicability under international law, or introducing new criteria for the acceptance of recommendations. Egypt argued that any recommendations falling outside the parameters of the institution

---

<sup>38</sup> regarding repealing provisions criminalising non-marital consensual sex and failing to recognise marital rape – recommendation made by Canada.

<sup>39</sup> decriminalising defamation – Canada.

<sup>40</sup> reviewing the death penalty, with a view towards introducing a moratorium and abolishing it – United Kingdom.

<sup>41</sup> repealing the *Haddood* and *Zina* Ordinances – United Kingdom.

<sup>42</sup> declaring a moratorium on executions and moving towards abolition – Switzerland.

<sup>43</sup> decriminalising adultery and non-marital consensual sex – Czech Republic.

<sup>44</sup> prohibiting provisions of the *Qisas* and *Diyat* law in cases of honour killings – Czech Republic.

<sup>45</sup> Slovenia.

<sup>46</sup> Switzerland, Mexico, Canada, Netherlands, Italy.

building package should not be called ‘recommendations’, and agreed with Pakistan that such were not covered by human rights law.

The Chair had no option but to announce that the report would be adopted on the following day, 14 May, following further consultations. On 14 May, the President read out the reworded paragraph, which was as follows: “Pakistan **considers** that recommendations contained in paragraphs 23(b) and (f), 27(b), 30(b) and (d), 43(c), and 62(b) and (e) in chapter II above are neither universally recognised human rights nor conform to its existing laws, pledges and commitments, and cannot accept them.” The report was then adopted by consensus.

## **COUNCIL MONITOR STAFF**

**Paul Działkowiec**, Human Rights Officer  
**Eléonore Dziurzynski**, Communications Officer  
**Chantal Mutamuriza**, Human Rights Officer  
**Michael Ineichen**, Human Rights Officer  
**Yuri Saito**, Fellow  
**Gareth Sweeney**, Deputy Manager  
**Katrine Thomasen**, Manager

### **Author of this report**

**Paul Działkowiec**, Intern

## **ABOUT THE PUBLICATION**

The Council Monitor forms part of the Human Rights Monitor Series produced by ISHR. It provides you with information about all the key developments at the Human Rights Council, including Daily Updates during the session of the Council, an Overview of the session, briefings and updates on the major issues of concern in the transition from the Commission on Human Rights to the Council and other key reports. It is currently an online publication that can be found at [www.ishr.ch](http://www.ishr.ch)

## **SUBSCRIPTION**

If you wish to receive the Council Monitor Daily Updates by e-mail during the Council session, please e-mail [information@ishr.ch](mailto:information@ishr.ch) with 'subscribe' in the subject line. Your e-mail address and personal information will not be shared or sold to any third parties. We may from time to time send you a notification about other publications in the Human Rights Monitor Series that you may be interested in downloading or subscribing to.

## **COPYRIGHT, DISTRIBUTION AND USE**

Copyright © 2008 International Service for Human Rights

Material from this publication may be reproduced for training, teaching or other non-commercial purposes as long as ISHR is fully acknowledged. You can also distribute this publication and link to it from your website as long as ISHR is fully acknowledged as the source. No part of this publication may be reproduced for any commercial purpose without the prior express permission of the copyright holders.

ISHR accepts no responsibility for any inaccuracies arising from or connected to unapproved or unofficial translations of its publications or parts thereof.

## **DISCLAIMER**

While every effort has been made to ensure the accuracy and reliability of the information contained in this publication, ISHR does not guarantee, and accepts no legal liability whatsoever arising from any possible mistakes in the information reported on, or any use of this publication. We are however happy to correct any errors you may come across so please notify [information@ishr.ch](mailto:information@ishr.ch).